

Brockman & Crestland Sidewalk Project
In-Person Meeting Comments, Questions & Answers

April 29, 2025

6-7:45pm

Attendance: 39 Residents / 5 City Staff

City Staff: Francisca Chan, Nicholas Hutchinson, Cyrus Naheedy, Jasmine Isaac, Nicholas Jacob
Wade Trim: Carmelle Tremblay

Comments

- While I prefer Concept 2, both are good.
- Weird NIMBYs scuttling this thoughtful plan, making it less safe for future generations of students and other pedestrians.
- Thank you for considering which properties would be most affected and for minimizing tree loss. These sidewalks will help keep my family safe!
- I like the concepts. I wish it were not so difficult to get sidewalk gaps filled. It shouldn't be a fight every time!
- Love sidewalks on both sides, love the bump outs.
- No concerns. Sidewalks are so great for many people. I welcome them and am excited to be able to walk on them.
- My taxes go to paying for safe transportation infrastructure. That money shouldn't be wasted on unrealistic plans for narrowing neighborhood streets when neighbors have already rejected street narrowing (2004). I walk and bike here to access stores, restaurants, schools, and more.
- Both concepts are good. I definitely like Concept 2 better given the speed management impacts. Recently, a sidewalk was built on Page with some narrowing, and the city ended

up continuing to allow parking on one side. It would be great if that could be done here too, but I support it regardless.

- Street recently narrowed to <22 feet still allow parking on one side – Page Ave. nearby is 20 feet with one side allowed to park and sidewalks were just installed last year. Please be equitable and allow parking on Brockman with option #2 which would still be wider than Page Ave. Also, Page Ave functions just fine as is on one side.
- City should relocate tree at 3035 and not charge homeowner.
- Brockman would like to see a possibility for plan 1.5 where north side sidewalk can be a little closer to street to allow street to be narrowed but still allow parking on one side or possibility for option 1 but incorporating bump out at Ferdon and then also at one or two places mid-block.
- I'm still not convinced the trees near the sidewalk will survive the root disturbance, but I am willing to hear more. I like Nick's idea for coaxing the roots to grow downward.
- I think Concept 2 will increase safety for bicycle traffic by eliminating parking and increasing visibility.
- Concerns about damage to tree's long-term health with either plan.
- If parking is eliminated on Brockman in Concept 2 it will end upon Anderson. Anderson now is crowded with cars even to the extent I am blocked into my driveway.
- When will the Ives Woods area, which currently have no sidewalks have, have sidewalks on both sides of street installed? Response: Exact timing has not been decided. Please visit the Sidewalk Dashboard to find out more of the sidewalk priority process.

<https://a2->

mi.maps.arcgis.com/apps/dashboards/7e0f896c311b4a4086fbe7e3136a9b9c#/7e0f896c311b4a4086fbe7e3136a9b9c

Questions & Answers

1. Can you move the beautiful red maple to location of property owner's choice? Response:
Where is the red maple and what is the diameter? Please email me the specifics. I can run this by our Forestry Department; we've relocated smaller healthy trees in the past.
However, moving mature trees given their root system would place us in excavating private property and risk the health of the tree and as such its not typically done at the City.
2. Your answer for why it can't be on just one side was very lame. "Because that's how we do it." But why? Zero flexibility? Zero thought? Response: the City's ultimate goal is to have sidewalks on both sides of all streets. Sometimes sidewalks will be built on one side of the street at a time in the short term due to cost concerns and/or technical challenges.
However, that is not the case on Brockman and Crestland.
3. Does construction of drains to the sewer at Brockman Court fall under the purview of this project? Response: No, the drains to the sewer at Brockman Court do not fall under the scope of this project.
4. Parking was preserved on one side of Page last year. Why can't that happen in Concept 2? Response: Staff is reviewing this.
5. Is the city willing to pay for the relocation of the trees in Concept 1? Response: The City will replant trees where possible, but will not relocate mature trees. How long would the implementation of each project take? For the sidewalk project for Brockman and Crestland initial construction estimation is 2 months but we will have a better idea once we have a design and finished plan set.
6. What is the typical life span of the trees along the route? Response: This question is not simple to answer. Like different animal species, tree life spans vary from species to

species. A black cherry may live 60-80 years, an oak may live 500-600 years, while ginkgos live over 1,000 years. These estimations are for trees planted in ideal locations without stressors or growth limitations. Street trees are in constant duress due to salt, soil compaction, pruning, space constraints, water access, canopy competition, disease, etc. This greatly impacts their lifespan. Sugar maples are one species along Brockman. These can live 300-400 years in a perfect situation. The city trees typically live 50-100 years.

7. The 22 minimum width = no parking on either side seems arbitrary. Who developed that standard? Lots of streets in America have width of 22 or less and maintain parking on one side. The city can make its own rules right? Response: Minimum street widths are typically developed by a combination of local government agencies, such as city or county engineering and planning departments, and guided by national or regional standards. These standards may be informed by organizations like the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials (AASHTO), the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE), and fire codes established by the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA). Final decisions usually reflect a balance between safety, emergency access, traffic flow, technical feasibility and land-use planning objectives. In this case the minimum street width of 20 feet (22 feet when you take into account the gutter pan) was set by the Fire Code.
8. If tree could be relocated who would pay? Would city help with potential relocation into yard? What type of tree would be replaced? Response: As mentioned previously, transplanting large mature trees can be very costly extensive process coupled with low

expectations of that tree surviving the process. We can consider relocating smaller healthy trees. If there is a specific situation please email directly so that we can see the type of tree and if we believe its viable to transplant. Trees species that are approved to be used as replacement trees is in the Forestry website, under Tree Resources. URL is here: https://www.a2gov.org/media/wyujac5n/approvedstreet-trees-by-size_march2017.pdf

9. When vote taken on concept, will the majority rule? Response: There will be no formal “vote” on the concepts. The City will seek feedback and may take a poll to inform the decision, but City staff will ultimately make the decision on which concept to pursue.

10. Concept 3? Parking on one side. Response: Staff is reviewing this. Narrow the green space and the sidewalk to provide additional width. Response: The City’s specifications call for a minimum sidewalk width of 5 feet. While it is possible to narrow or eliminate the space between the sidewalk and the curb, this puts pedestrians uncomfortably close to the street and also provides no place for snow storage when streets are plowed, thus this is not a preferable change.

Preferences

The responses **received** at the April 29th meeting are as follows:

- 6 residents preferred Concept 1
- 12 residents preferred Concept 2
- 3 residents found Concept 1 or Concept 2 to be acceptable
- 8 residents felt that they needed more time to review the Concepts
- 2 residents found neither Concept 1 nor Concept 2 acceptable

Disclaimer: This was a poll to consider everyone’s feedback and how to revise the concepts, it is not a vote.